Yukon Women in Trades and Technology

Evaluation Report

Prepared for: Advanced Education, Department of Education, Yukon Government

March 2010

Whitehorse, Yukon
Christine.Cleghorn@northwestel.net
Index

Executive Summary.................................................................3
Introduction..................................................................................4
Background..................................................................................4
Yukon WITT Program Overview...............................................7
Program Evaluation Methodology and Data Analysis...............8
Findings
  Labour Market Climate 1999-2009........................................11
  YWITT Organizational Effectiveness.................................14
  Program Outcomes...............................................................14
Recommendations......................................................................15
Appendices
  A. YWITT Evaluation: Terms of Reference
  B. Interview Guides
  C. List of individuals interviewed
  D. Bibliography
Executive Summary

The Government of Yukon, Advanced Education (AE), has taken action to increase the participation of women in trades and technology employment. Yukon Women in Trades and Technology (YWITT), a non-profit organization, has acted as a key partner in this effort.

It is clear that since a comprehensive analysis of women's participation rates in trades related employment was undertaken in 1999, including the identification of barriers to their full engagement, much has happened. YWITT has sponsored conferences, hosted workshops and has advocated for policy change. All this has served to acquaint women with opportunities for careers in the trades and raised general awareness of the challenges women face, and the barriers that need to be overcome, in their quest to seek employment in this sector.

It is equally clear that, despite best efforts, the number of women employed as apprentices and at the journey level, as a percentage of the total trades' people in the workforce, has not changed in any significant way since 1999. This does not negate the value of the good work done to date nor defy the substantial support YWITT receives from NGOs, employers, volunteers and clients who know of and/or who have worked with them.

It does suggest however, that efforts should increase to determine what YWITT does that is effective and why. It suggests that AE and YWITT should work together to set clear performance targets and collect data that would verify the degree to which initiatives are achieving objectives.

Good work has been undertaken in the past to identify barriers to women's participation in the trades but there is, as yet, little analysis to determine the degree to which these barriers are coming down.

Finally, most effort undertaken by YWITT has focussed on acquainting women with trades related employment. There has been comparatively little analysis of women's participation in the technology sector and whether there should be effort taken to increase it in the future.
Introduction

The following report is a program evaluation of YWITT conducted for the Department of Education, Advanced Education (AE). While YWITT receives funding from other sources including the Yukon Government’s Women’s Directorate, this evaluation focuses on whether it is meeting the requirements of AE's contribution agreements.

The evaluation plan incorporated questions that should be posed and answered (Appendix A). These were incorporated into the Question Guides (Appendix C) and put to YWITT volunteers, consumers, partners and funders (Appendix B). A document analysis was undertaken to acquire a thorough understanding of what has happened in the past and what agreements were reached and expectations were established by key partners (Appendix D).

The evaluation seeks to determine whether YWITT has met the requirements of the Contribution Agreement with AE, and the extent to which its initiatives have diminished the barriers between women and careers in non-traditional trades and technology.

Background

Madsen Report 1999

In 1999, Advanced Education and the Women’s Directorate undertook a joint study with three objectives:

1) to determine the current situation of women in apprenticeship and trades in the Yukon;
2) to assess the pertinent issues affecting trades women with respect to training and employment; and
3) to create a series of recommendations with the intention of improving the representation of women in apprenticeship and trades in the Yukon.

The report on the study's findings, Yukon Women in Apprenticeship and Trades, conducted by Kirsten Madsen through the Northern Research Institute, identified clear trends and barriers regarding women's participation in trades and technology employment in the Yukon. Highlights included:

- Women make up nearly half of the Yukon’s paid labour force, but tend to be concentrated in jobs that pay them less than those of men.
- 13% of students registered in non-traditional trades programs at Yukon College were women. Women made up 3% of non-traditional trades apprenticeships across the Yukon.
- The average age of women entering trades in the Yukon was 25. Most women were not entering trades directly after high school.
- Friends and peers, income needs and family were the biggest influences on respondents’
decision to pursue trades.
- Women already working in trades felt that there is greater acceptance of women working in trades in the Yukon compared to the rest of Canada.

The report provided a number of recommendations towards increasing the participation of women in the trades and technology sectors. These included:

- Improve and increase education – most young women are unlikely to consider employment in the trades unless they have strong family influence in that area, take a shop class in school, see female role models in trades, or they have direct, hands-on experience in a trade.
- Teach women “survival skills” including assertiveness and life skills training.
- Increase awareness of the financial security and opportunities for job satisfaction that trades employment offers.
- Combat negative socialization – young women continue to be socialized towards a narrow band of trades (e.g. hairdressing), or towards office-type work.
- Provide programs for women enabling them to move into trades while at the same time avoiding perceptions of ‘special treatment’ which may harm women who come later.
- Improve the learning environment and innovate with new training techniques including offering women-only training and making classrooms gender sensitive.
- Create women’s networks which offer peer support and opportunities for mentoring.
- Encourage changes to be made to the trades’ workplace including increasing financial support for women in trades’ employment.

The report pointed to Women in Trades and Technology (WITT) courses as proven programming for encouraging women interested in pursuing trades training to take up a trade but who are unsure how and where to begin. WITT programs typically allow women to explore their interest in a trade through an introductory workshop or short course at the end of which they would have sufficient exposure to determine their interest in pursuing further training or apprenticeship. Many of the educators surveyed during the course of the report indicated that women tended to do better in the theory components of the courses and less well in the hands-on or practical components. This was the case because they believed many women lacked pre-course experience.

**YWITT Established 2000**

The Yukon Chapter of WITT was formed as a non-profit society in August of 2000. It, like WITT organizations across the country, established itself as an education and advocacy organization dedicated to promoting and assisting in the recruitment, training and retention of women in the skilled trades and technology sectors. It dedicated itself to identifying barriers that women faced in entering the workforce and has embraced the goal to increase the participation of women in well-paying, in-demand and respected trades and technology jobs through ongoing projects and workshops.
Follow-up Report 2005

In 2005, the Women’s Directorate and Advanced Education undertook to update the Madsen Report/1999, in order to see if the representation of women in the trades had improved. This update, entitled *Yukon Women in Trades - Follow-up Report 2005*, summarized the major initiatives that had been implemented in the 1999-2005 period:

- Formation of a Yukon Women in Technology and Trades (YWITT) organization with a mandate to support tradeswomen and encourage women’s participation in the trades.
- Initiation of Skills Canada Yukon workshops targeting women and girls (e.g. Mother/Daughter carpentry night)
- Launch of a Young Women Exploring Trades Conference
- Introduction of the Education’s Apprenticeship Unit’s *Step into the Trades* Campaign
- Development of a Departmental Women in Apprenticeship and Trades web page
- Adoption of gender-specific traffic safety clothing available to female workers at YG’s Department of Highways

The Follow-up Report 2005 reviewed statistics about the representation of women in trades and technology in the Yukon. Specifically, the report noted a slight decrease in the percentage of women apprenticeships in non-traditional trades, down to 2% in 2004 from 3% in 1999. Women in non-traditional apprenticeships represented 4% of the total receiving certificates in 2004, indicating that women are succeeding in completing their apprenticeships and certifying in their trades. The report concluded:

The statistics presented here show that Yukon women’s representation in trades remains low. In some cases, particularly in the employment sphere, women’s representation has even decreased since 1999. However, ...women’s representation among those with trades certificates has increased slightly over the Census years. Change can be slow; however a number of initiatives have been put into place to increase women’s participation.

The report pointed to Yukon WITT as having made significant progress in responding to the recommendation in the 1999 report, *Yukon Women in Apprenticeship and Trades*, to provide programs for women:

Yukon WITT offers a variety of introductory trades’ courses for women only. These courses have been extremely popular and usually have a long waiting list due to excess registration. The Young Women Exploring Trades conference features fun participatory workshops in trades for Grade 8 girls. Skills Canada offers a women’s carpentry night that is very popular. These initiatives offer several benefits: women learn new skills for use in home or work, skills they can model for family and children to show women in a variety of roles.
Yukon YWITT Program Overview

Yukon Women in Trades and Technology (YWITT) is an education and advocacy organization dedicated to promoting and assisting in the recruitment, training, and retention of women in the skilled trades and technology sectors. Formed in 2000, YWITT is a non-profit, non-government organization working towards,

increasing the participation of women in well-paying, in-demand and respected trades and technology jobs through ongoing projects and workshops. These projects and workshops are designed by women, for women, thus exposing them to the lucrative and exciting field of trades. (www.yukonwitt.org)

YWITT is governed by a volunteer Board of Directors with a 3/4 time Executive Director. It received in the last full year of operation (2008/2009) approximately $133,000 of which Advanced Education’s contribution through the Community Training Fund amounted to approximately 55% of its total revenue.

Under the CTF agreement in 2008/09 YWITT conducted adult workshops in Dry-walling, Flooring Installation, Wood Working, Advanced Silversmithing, Electrical, Intro Silversmithing, and Bicycle Maintenance. In addition, YWITT hosted community workshops for adults in Old Crow in Chainsaw Maintenance and Tile Setting. In addition, 6 workshops were also hosted for girls in the communities of Old Crow, Faro and Whitehorse schools. Attendance at these workshops averaged 6 to 7 participants with high completion rates. Further, YWITT organized two conferences including the Young Women Exploring Trades Conference and the Ms Infinity Conference with 96 and 31 participants respectively. Participants included girls from Whitehorse and a number of rural Yukon communities. Participants and volunteers associated with these events reported a high degree of satisfaction with the outcomes. The Year End Report for 2008-09 accounted for participation and success rates but was unable to report effectively on employment outcomes.

2009 represented the final year in YWITT’s Strategic Plan (2007 to 2009). This Strategic Plan, adopted by the YWITT Board of Directors, identified as its overall goal: “To increase the participation of women in well-paying, in-demand and respected trades and technology jobs through projects designed for women to bring them into the lucrative and exciting field of trades”. A stated planning objective is to “revisit [the] Strategic Plan regularly and make it a working document at Board meetings”.

The Strategic Plan adopted six (6) sub-goals:

1. Training - offer training to Yukon women to increase their skills in trades and technology
2. Retention - Work with employers to make Yukon trades workplaces open and attractive to women workers
3. Organization - Strengthen YWITT as an active, relevant, sustainable organization
4. Recruitment - Attract women of all ages to careers in trades and technology
5. Education - Promote trades careers and provide skills to young women
6. Advocacy - Provide a community voice to Yukon tradeswomen and advocate on their behalf

Each sub-goal has multiple objectives, suggested strategic considerations, action items and expected outcomes. It is clearly ambitious and reflects the aspirations of those consulted in the *Yukon Women in Apprenticeship and Trades 1999 Report* as well as the *Yukon Women in Trades - Follow Up Report 2005.*

**Program Evaluation Methodology and Data Analysis**

**Methodology**

The scope of the evaluation included an assessment of the requirements of the contribution agreement (2008-09) between YWITT and AE as well as to answer supplementary questions posed by AE related to YWITT outcomes. A cursory analysis was also undertaken of the outcomes of the YWITT Strategic Plan to determine the utility of this planning document.

A variety of methods to acquire relevant data were employed including direct interviews with YWITT volunteers and staff; consumers; partners (NGO's, unions, college and businesses) and; funders. Interview guides were drafted (see Appendix B); people were interviewed and a document review was undertaken. The sourcing of information to answer the questions posed by AE is identified in (Appendix A).

The contribution agreement (2008/09) required YWITT to undertake specific deliverables. They included:

- Young Women Exploring Trades Conference
- Ms Infinity Conference
- Adult Workshops:
  - Introductory exploring trades courses - at least two of each of carpentry, sheet metal/welding, car care clinics and home repair clinics
  - Advanced workshops - at least two 'possibly in carpentry/woodworking and sheet/metal'
  - Hands on workshops in at least two rural schools
  - Tradeswomen Conference
- Maintain good administrative practices including the maintenance of a website

**Analysis**

It would appear that all deliverables identified in the contribution agreement between AE and YWITT were undertaken. The agreement identified activities without outlining any specific expectations relating to outcomes or information that should be collected to verify whether the each activity was more or less useful in achieving the overall objective of advancing women's active employment in a trade.

With respect to the supplementary questions posed by AE the following conclusions were reached:
1. To what extent has YWITT achieved the intended objectives and outcomes? In particular, how effectively has it addressed labour market shortages in the trades?
   - YWITT met the requirements of the contribution agreement. However there is little to no data available to determine whether YWITT programming has increased women's employment in the trades or whether women have been encouraged to participate in trades where there are labour market shortages. Anecdotal evidence suggests that YWITT activities have impacted a number of individuals positively leading to further interest in trades' related activity.

2. What was the uptake of the programs offered through YWITT?
   - Workshops sponsored by YWITT have had an average of 6 to 7 participants in each. Most are considered ‘full’ and some had waiting lists. The Young Women Exploring Trades Conference normally has around 120 participants.

3. What was the completion rate of the programs?
   - YWITT reports that the completion rate is very high. In 2008/09 the rate is nearly 100%.

4. How many program participants have since chosen to continue formal training in a trade?
   - Program participants have not been tracked by YWITT or the College to determine whether they have advanced to further trades training or pre-employment training. There is insufficient data to answer this question.

5. What is the success rate of female trades graduates in finding employment in a trade?
   - Program participants have not been tracked by YWITT or the College to determine whether they have sought or attained employment in a trade. There is insufficient data to answer this question.

6. What is the reputation of YWITT amongst stakeholders?
   - YWITT volunteers, NGOs, Union and Business Representatives express respect and support for the work that YWITT is doing. They particularly support YWITT’s objectives but have little working knowledge whether YWITT is contributing to an increase in the number of women engaged in trades and technology employment. YWITT is known to deliver quality workshops.

7. What were the opportunities/barriers to addressing trades labour market shortages with women?
   - Major barriers facing women entering trades employment, as identified in the Madsen report 1999, continue to exist. Data has not been collected that would verify the degree to which the situation has improved or deteriorated.

8. How well was the training courses and workshop curriculum followed? What should be changed in the curriculum?
   - The curriculum has evolved over time for the various workshops. The workshops are small and instructors adapt the courses to each group while retaining fundamental elements.

9. How well have the programs worked for the participants?
   - Participants have reported satisfaction with the workshops in particular but there is no apparent direct link to trades employment or filling labour market shortages.
10. How well have the programs worked for employers of trades women?
   ➢ Employers know of YWITT’s mandate but none knew whether YWITT program participants gained employment with their businesses.

11. How do participants rate the quality of the programming?
   ➢ Consistently very high.

12. What barriers are there to participants accessing the program?
   ➢ It is more of a challenge for program participants to access the McCrae site than if the workshop space was located downtown or at a location better served by public transportation. The cost of participating in workshops is kept deliberately low.

13. What are the costs associated with delivering YWITT programming?
   ➢ In 2008/2009 YWITT’s total budget was $133,000.

14. Is YWITT making adequate use of existing community and governmental resources? How adequate are these resources in meeting YWITT’s objectives?
   ➢ YWITT undertakes activities to the extent that they have available staff and volunteer time.

15. Has YWITT been timely in submitting accurate program and financial reports?
   ➢ Yes.

16. How effectively does the Tradeswomen Conference contribute to YWITT meeting its objectives and outcomes?
   ➢ Anecdotal evidence suggests that it is very important. There is no data to confirm or contradict this notion.

17. How effectively has YWITT’s outreach into schools contributed to YWITT meeting its objectives and outcomes?
   ➢ Anecdotal evidence suggests that outreach to girls in schools is a key factor for girls considering a career in trades. There is no data to confirm or contradict this notion.

18. How effectively has YWITT used its volunteers to meet its objectives? What supports are in place to ensure volunteers can effectively meet their responsibilities?
   ➢ YWITT ably supports its volunteers. Most volunteer activity is focussed around annual conferences, workshop delivery and board activities.

19. What are the unexpected results of YWITT?
   ➢ None were identified.

20. What lessons were learned about the delivery of the training?
   ➢ Many participants reported that they were most satisfied with ‘hands on’ training otherwise referred to as ‘learning by doing’.

21. How effective are YWITT’s data collection methods?
   ➢ YWITT fulfils data collection requirements in that it is able to provide Year End Reports, Annual Reports, financial Reports, Conference Reports, Conference Evaluations, and Workshop Evaluations.

22. What can be improved in overall program delivery?
   ➢ See recommendations.
YWITT’s Strategic Plan outlined six goals and multiple objectives to reflect a full range of activity the organization wished to pursue. It would appear that the Strategic Plan was rarely referenced in the ongoing work of the organization. As this evaluation did not specifically set out to assess YWITT’s performance against the Strategic Plan there is no comprehensive analysis contained herein.

Findings

Labour Market Climate 1999-2009

In 1999, the Madsen report described women’s participation in the Yukon labour market. It noted that women comprised 47.5% of the working population, and made 79 cents for every dollar made by men. Statistics Canada information revealed that, “in 1996, more Canadian women reported themselves as retail salespersons than any other occupation, followed by secretaries and cashiers. Women represented only 22% of all earners in the 25 highest paying occupations” (Madsen, 1999). According to the Women’s Directorate, women with some post-secondary education earn less, on average, than men with less than grade 9 education (Madsen, 1999). One explanation for this is that many occupations that are traditionally pursued mostly by males, provide higher income returns for less education. Skilled trades such as plumbing, carpentry, and welding, are examples of such occupations. Madsen noted that women made up 3% of those registered in non-traditional trades programs at Yukon College.

By 2005, women comprised 48.7% of Yukon’s workforce. In 2010, women comprise 49.1% of the Yukon’s workforce (Yukon Bureau of Statistics January 2010 Employment report).

According to Statistics Canada’s 2006 Aboriginal Population Profile, 210 Aboriginal women in Yukon had completed an apprenticeship or trades certificate or diploma. This includes traditional trades such as hairstyling and cook. 65 aboriginal women were working in trades, transport, and equipment operators and related occupations, compared to 700 aboriginal men in this category. There were 10 aboriginal women working in occupations unique to processing, manufacturing, and utilities, compared to 45 males in this category.

Women’s representation in the workforce is growing, but their representation in non-traditional trades is not keeping pace. In 2005, 19 women were registered in non-traditional trades apprenticeships, out of a total of 301 apprentices. By 2009, 54 women were registered in non-traditional trades apprenticeships, out of 520 total apprentices. Although the number of women enrolled in non-traditional trades apprenticeships is growing, as a percentage of total apprentices the number has shrunk from 15.8% in 2005 to 9.6% in 2009. Figure 1 shows the numbers in more detail.
The following table shows which programs at Yukon College have had women graduates since 2005. It indicates that the top choices for women are carpenter, construction electrician, painter and decorator, partsperson, plumber, and sheet metal worker.

source: Yukon Government, Advanced Education
Figure 2: Non-Traditional Trades Graduates 2000-2009 by Calendar Year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year (Total)</th>
<th>2005 (365)</th>
<th>2006 (428)</th>
<th>2007 (458)</th>
<th>2008 (504)</th>
<th>2009 (524)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>T</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automotive Painter</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automotive Service Technician</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baker</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpenter</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>155</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrician</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cook</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hairstylist</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industrial Electrician</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Motor Vehicle Body</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repairer (P&amp;M)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oil Burner Mechanic</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Painter and Decorator</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partsperson</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plumber</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RV Technician</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheet Metal Worker</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sprinkler System</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Installer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steamfitter/Pipefitter</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Welder</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
YWITT Organizational Effectiveness

YWITT has a stable Board of Directors and low staff turnover. There is a strong institutional memory. Financial reports are accurate and submitted on time. Volunteers are welcomed, treated respectfully, and appropriately supported.

YWITT has had a strategic plan in the past, but the plan failed to become integral to the organization’s activities. Since this plan has recently expired, an opportunity exists for the Board and staff to create a new, more meaningful plan.

YWITT depends largely upon funding from the Women’s Equality Fund and from Advanced Education. Additional money is raised from the private sector towards the Young Women Exploring Trades Conference. Private sector partners donate shop space, supplies, and workspaces in support of YWITT workshops.

YWITT has partnered effectively with a number of organizations to meet complimentary needs resourcefully and efficiently. Two examples of this are YWITT’s delivering various workshops at the Habitat for Humanity construction site, and showing leadership in the Victoria Faulkner Women’s Centre’s Extreme Makeover Renovation.

While YWITT has created strong links in the community, it has failed to develop a strong relationship with Advanced Education, to the extent that YWITT seems unsure of the mutually shared goals between themselves and Advanced Education, or the need to establish the Department of Education as an advocacy target.

Program Outcomes

The lack of data about YWITT’s effect on the number of women in non-traditional trades and technology jobs makes reaching conclusions about program outcomes very difficult. At the same time, after 10 years, the organization is stable, has developed a sound reputation in the community, and is known to deliver interesting workshops with quality instruction. Women’s representation in non-traditional trades has increased marginally in the 10 years that YWITT has been in operation. Unfortunately, the only evidence to support YWITT’s role in this increase is anecdotal.
Recommendations

Advanced Education funds YWITT specifically to increase the number of women pursuing careers in the trades and technology sector. While much has been done in the last few years to promote many of YWITT’s objectives it is difficult to assess what specific activities undertaken by them are most effective in increasing women’s participation in the workforce. YWITT does not, and has not been required to, measure their progress in this regard. There is in fact little data beyond general participation rates and anecdotal accounts that can verify where YWITT is making the most progress. Consequently Advanced Education needs to clarify their expectations of YWITT; agree on appropriate performance indicators; and ensure that information is being collected to measure the success of various initiatives.

1. Clarification of Expectations

The relationship between Advanced Education and YWITT can be characterized as distant. Since Advanced Education’s mandate is labour force related, their expectations of YWITT should be clarified in this regard. Progress should be measured by the actual number of women working in non-traditional trades and technology.

A new focus on women working in trades and technology will likely require new strategic thinking on the part of YWITT. A new strategic plan that clearly links activities with labour market outcomes should be developed in the short term. This plan must meaningfully integrate into the organization.

YWITT should, as part of the visioning that informs the strategic planning process, determine if they are prepared to identify goals and activities related to women’s employment in technology, or whether YWITT should undergo a name change that more accurately reflects their mandate. To date, the technology portion of their mandate has not been a focus.

2. Performance Indicators

Evaluating the effectiveness of YWITT was significantly hindered by a lack of available data. Advanced Education and YWITT need to agree on acceptable performance indicators that would demonstrate how the outcomes of YWITT’s activities are meeting the needs of Advanced Education. While there is much anecdotal evidence of people’s appreciation of YWITT’s efforts, there should be a move to a more sophisticated means of tracking success. Performance indicators should directly relate to how women are advancing towards either employment, or training for employment. When YWITT undertakes activities with long-term outcomes, for example the Young Women
Exploring Trades conference, indicators demonstrating 'shifts in attitude' and 'increasing acceptance of trades employment among young women' would be needed.

Performance indicators should be tied to a meaningful strategic plan. YWITT’s most recent strategic plan (2007 to 2009) has expired, and a new plan should be developed. A new strategic plan should have a clear sense of priorities which, in particular, relate to reducing the major barriers facing women entering non-traditional trades and technology careers. Performance indicators should demonstrate whether actions taken are reducing barriers and increasing women’s participation rates in targeted employment.

3. Information

Once performance indicators are established, data should be collected to provide information about the success of various initiatives and activities. A simple example of this would be for YWITT to track referrals to the Yukon College’s TEP-W and TEP programs. Another would be to keep records of all advocacy-related correspondence and related policy or program changes. This information would demonstrate that YWITT is taking meaningful action to break down the obstacles keeping women out of non-traditional trades and technology careers.
### Appendices

#### A. YWITT Evaluation Terms of Reference

The following table outlines the specific questions posited in the contract to evaluate YWITT and the sources used to identify relevant information:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Interview</th>
<th>Focus Group</th>
<th>Document Review</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) To what extent has YWITT achieved the intended objectives and outcomes? In particular, how effectively has it addressed labor market shortages in the trades?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2) What was the uptake of the programs offered through YWITT?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3) What was the completion rate of the programs?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4) How many program participants have since chosen to continue formal training in a trade?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) What is the success rate of female trades graduates in finding employment in a trade?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6) What is the reputation of YWITT amongst stakeholders?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7) What were the opportunities/barriers to addressing trades labour market shortages with women?</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8) How well was the training courses and workshop curriculum followed?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9) What should be changed in the curriculum? Why?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10) How well have the programs worked for the participants?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11) How well have the programs worked for employers of trades women?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12) How do participants rate the quality of the programming?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13) What barriers are there to participants accessing the program?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14) What are the costs associated with delivering YWITT programming?</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15) Is YWITT making adequate use</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has YWITT been timely in submitting accurate program and financial reports?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How effectively does the Tradeswomen Conference contribute to YWITT meeting its objectives and outcomes?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How effectively has YWITT’s outreach into schools contributed to YWITT meeting its objectives and outcomes?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How effectively has YWITT used its volunteers to meet its objectives? What supports are in place to ensure volunteers can effectively meet their responsibilities?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the unexpected results of YWITT?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What lessons were learned about the delivery of the training?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How effective are YWITT’s data collection methods?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What can be improved in overall program delivery?</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td>x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
B. Interview Guides

To YWITT consumers:

1) Are you employed in Trades or Technology related work?
2) What, if any, are the barriers to you gaining employment or improving your employment status in the Trades and Tech fields?
3) What training have you taken so far to advance yourself? Was this a good experience? What challenges did you face?
4) If you are employed has your employer been helpful in assisting you get training and assisted your advancement in the Trades?
5) How did you hear about YWITT?
6) What did you want from, or were expecting from, YWITT?
7) What service did you receive or what information did receive from YWITT. Was it useful to you? How so?
8) Has YWITT increased your employability?
9) If you have taken training with YWITT
   a. What did you like about the training?
   b. What improvements would you recommend? (specifics)
   c. Did you improve your employability?
10) What else could YWITT do to assist women and girls in pursuing employment in trades and technology?

To YWITT partners (NGOs/unions etc/employers)

1) Do you know YWITT's objectives? What of their activities do you know about?
2) Do you support these objectives? Do you believe that they are competently filling these objectives?
3) They have 6 goals. How well is YWITT achieving these:
   a. Offer Training to Yukon Women
   b. Job Retention - Work with Employers
   c. Strengthen YWITT
   d. Recruit women into Trades and Technology Employment
   e. Education - Promote Careers in TT to women
   f. Advocacy
4) Have you found YWITT fills a void that is not occupied by others?
5) Does YWITT work well with other organizations with similar or overlapping mandates? How so?
6) Would people you serve gain much value by taking advantage of YWITT services?
7) If you employ people who have used YWITT services is there an identifiable improvement in their performance?
8) Would you use YWITT again (why)?

To YWITT funders:

1) Does YWITT achieve the stated objectives in the contribution agreement?
2) Does the YWITT strategic plan reflect these objectives? Is YWITT undertaking things that are inconsistent with the contribution agreement?
3) They have 6 goals. How well is YWITT achieving these: (specifics)
   a. Offer Training to Yukon Women
   b. Job Retention - Work with Employers
   c. Strengthen YWITT
   d. Recruit women into Trades and Technology Employment
   e. Education - Promote Careers in TT to women
   f. Advocacy
4) What improvements can YWITT make to what it is doing to better achieve its objectives?
5) Do you maintain good effective contact with YWITT?
6) Is the financial reporting up to date and informative? Any problems with the accounting?
7) Does YWITT liaise and coordinate its activities with government depts and agencies and the Yukon College? Is there a sense of partnership in achieving common objectives?
8) Are there activities that YWITT is doing that should not be done at all or that can be done better by some other organization?
9) Do you deliver clear performance targets for YWITT? Do they suggest clear performance targets so that they can determine the effectiveness of their various programs and services?
10) What is the quality of work they provide. Any issues?
11) What quality of information does YWITT provide to justify the decisions it makes and demonstrates the effectiveness of its investment?
12) One objective they have is to fund raise from private sources. How well are they doing? What are your expectations in this regard?
13) How do you know whether YWITT is useful in increasing participation rates of women in trades and technological employment?
14) Would YWITT benefit from ‘performance based funding’?

To YWITT:

1) To what extent has YWITT achieved the intended objectives and outcomes?
   i. What specifically are the objectives and how do you measure your success. How do you know that specific initiatives are achieving your objectives?
   ii. What was the uptake of the program? How many people use your services and participate in your workshops etc?
iii. How do you advertise your services?
iv. What was the completion rate of the program? How many people complete your program and continue with the pursuit of trades and tech training and seek employment in these fields?
v. How many program participants have since chosen to continue formal training in a trade? Do you maintain any formal contact with institutions like Yukon College or the Building Trades to share information?
vi. If you don't track the progress of girls and women how do you know what you are doing is making a difference in increasing participation rates? How do you determine if any particular initiative is more effective at achieving your objectives than others...or even determining whether some things you are doing are useful at all?
vii. What is the success rate of female trades graduates in finding employment in a trade? If you don't believe this question is relevant how are you shaping your programs (such as employer awareness) to assist female trades graduates? Shouldn't you be aware of the interest levels of women and their success at achieving progress at various points in the training/employment continuum?
viii. What is the reputation of YWITT amongst stakeholders? How do you determine that you are meeting the objectives of your stakeholders including governments, unions and businesses. Do you ask them to participate in any performance appraisal of YWITT?
ix. What were the opportunities/barriers to addressing trades labour market shortages with women? How do you define and measure these barriers so that governments may know where they can best invest their resources in eliminating them? How do you determine the severity of some barriers so that YWITT can allocate their time and resources accordingly?

YWITT Strategic Plan has 6 Goals:

1. Offer Training to Yukon Women
   i. How do you determine which courses to offer?
   ii. Do you liaise with other training providers to determine who best can deliver the training?
   iii. How do determine the success of the programs? Do you check back with employers to determine whether they value the programs?
   iv. How do you assess whether the training offerings can be improved?
   v. Are there barriers to women accessing these training offerings? How are these mitigated?
   vi. How do you determine whether the training is efficiently delivered and that choices of what training is offered achieves the objective of greater female participation in T&T employment.
   vii. What lessons were learned about the delivery of the training?
2. **Job Retention - Work with Employers**  
   i. Ask about progress made with each identified strategic action.

3. **Strengthen YWITT**  
   i. Ask about progress made with each identified strategic action  
   ii. Has YWITT been timely in submitting accurate program and financial reports? Is the annual report the best reporting method with funders?  
   iii. Are there other mechanisms to discuss YWITT progress with funders that you would like to use?  
   iv. How effectively has YWITT used its volunteers to meet its objectives? What supports are in place to ensure volunteers can effectively meet their responsibilities?  
   v. How effective are YWITT’s data collection methods?

4. **Recruit women into Trades and Technology Employment**  
   i. Ask about progress made with each identified strategic action

5. **Education - Promote Careers in TT to women**  
   i. Ask about progress made with each identified strategic action  
   ii. How effectively has YWITT’s outreach into schools contributed to YWITT meeting its objectives and outcomes?

6. **Advocacy**  
   i. Ask about progress made with each identified strategic action
C. List of individuals interviewed

1. Government/College - Training and Education
   i. Brent Slobodin, ADM, Advanced Education
   ii. Shawn Kitchen, Director of Labour Market Programs & Services, Advanced Education
   iii. John Gryba, Director of Training Programs, Advanced Education
   iv. Danielle Sheldon, Advanced Education
   v. Brenda Barnes, Women's Directorate
   vi. Kirsten Madsen, Women’s Directorate
   vii. Dave Nugent, Chair, Trades and Technology, School of Science Trades and Technology, Yukon College
   viii. Diane Williams, Director, Training Policy Committee

2. NGO/Union
   i. Patricia Curtis, Program Coordinator, YWITT
   ii. Lynn Standing, Board of Directors, YWITT
   iii. Betty Irwin, Board of Directors, YWITT
   iv. Leah Battersby, Board of Directors, YWITT
   v. Lynn Lebarge, Board of Directors, YWITT
   vi. Cathie Archbould, Volunteer, YWITT
   vii. Sheila Merkley, Volunteer, YWITT
   viii. Don Austin, Plumbers & Pipefitters Local 310
   ix. Women’s Advocate, Victoria Faulkner Women’s Centre

3. Business/Government - Employers
   i. Martha Kelly, PSC, Yukon Government
   ii. Northwestel
   iii. Steve Duncan, Duncan’s
   iv. Peter Densmore, Ketza Construction
   v. Randy Shewen, Dominion Construction
   vi. Gary Bailey - Kwanlin Dun First Nation

4. Others
   i. Meaghan Christie, Carpenter
   ii. Katherine Alexander, Welder
   iii. Amy Isles, Heavy Equipment Operator
   iv. Tanya Handley, Graphic Designer
D. Bibliography

1. Yukon Women in Apprenticeship and Trades - 1999 - Kirsten Madsen
2. Yukon Women in Trades - Follow UP Report 2005
5. Yukon WITT - Community Training Fund - Year End Report 2008-09
6. YWITT Transfer Payment Agreement 2009 - 2010 (with Advanced Education)
8. One Bird - Evaluation Proposal - January 2010
9. Evaluation docs:
   a. Advanced Education Evaluation Terms of Reference
   b. YWITT Newsletter - January 2010
   c. YWITT workshop participant evaluation forms
   e. Annual Apprenticeship Numbers 2008 - 2009